Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance – Tome LXIX – 2007 – n° 2, pp. 447-472

CHRONIQUE

PROPAGANDA, PRINT, AND PERSUASION IN THE FRENCH REFORMATION: A REVIEW ARTICLE[1]

Jean-François Gilmont and William Kemp eds. *Le livre évangélique en français avant Calvin. Etudes originales, publications d'inédits, catalogues d'éditions anciennes/The French evangelical book before Calvin: Original analyses, newly edited texts, bibliographic catalogues*. Nugae humanisticae sub signo Erasmi vol. 4. Turnhout: Brépols, 2004. 391pp.

Jean-François Gilmont. *Le livre réformé au XVI^e siècle*. Conférences Léopold Delisle. Paris: Bibliothèque nationale de France, 2005. 151 pp.

Clive Griffin. *Journeymen-Printers, Heresy, and the Inquisition in Sixteenth-Century Spain*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. xiv + 318 pp.

Andrew Pettegree. *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. xii + 237 pp.

Ilana Zinguer and Myriam Yardeni eds., *Les deux réformes chrétiennes. Propagation et diffusion*. Studies in the History of Christian Traditions vol. 114. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2004. xx + 533 pp.

In the introduction to *Les deux réformes chrétiennes. Propagation et diffusion*, Bernard Roussel observes that nearly a half century has passed since the appearance of the pioneering collective volume *Aspects de la propagande religieuse*[2]. That book was a landmark in the study of the francophone Reformation, a book that, in Roussel's words, «for many of us seemed to accompany us for decades of research and to open new horizons that led us into previously little cultivated domains» (p. xii). Not only did it offer the first analysis of the «affaire des placards» to draw upon the recently discovered original text of the notorious broadside. Not only did it reveal for the first time the vast distribution network organized by Laurent de Normandie to smuggle Genevan publications

[1] I am grateful to Irena Backus, Ulinka Rublack, and Malcolm Walsby for leads and information in connection with this essay, and to Irena Backus, Mark Greengrass, and Daniela Solfaroli-Camillocci for extremely helpful comments on a prior draft. The «Champel reading group» provided the forum for an initial discussion of Andrew Pettegree's *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* to which my treatment of that book is much indebted.

[2] *Aspects de la propagande religieuse* (Geneva, 1957). This work was conceived and brought to fruition by Eugénie Droz.

into France in the 1550s. More broadly, it showed future generations of scholars how the previously hidden channels through which Protestant ideas spread in France could be brought to light by combining the archival reconstruction of the world of booksellers and printing workers, the hunt for rare editions of printed works in out-of-the-way libraries, and the use of the techniques of material bibliography to unmask false typographical addresses and to determine who printed anonymous works. For readers who first encountered *Aspects* in the decades of cold war and would-be revolution that followed its publication, the fact that its innovative methods and exceptional erudition were devoted to a shadow world of clandestine actors in another great ideological struggle further enhanced the book's excitement.

Today, as these five volumes show, the study of printed propaganda and the book trades has settled into a comfortable middle age as a well-established sector of international scholarship about the French Reformation. Over the past decades, a number of highly productive scholars, most notably Francis Higman, Jean-François Gilmont, and Andrew Pettegree, have deepened and extended the *histoire du livre* tradition of research epitomized by *Aspects de la propagande religieuse*. As *Les deux réformes chrétiennes: propagation et diffusion* illustrates, the subject also flourishes because it stands at a point of intersection between the interests of historians, historians of literature, and historians of theology. Last but not least, wider changes in international Reformation scholarship over the past half-century have encouraged the investigation of the contents and diffusion of evangelical propaganda[3]. In the domain of German Reformation studies, the intense interest in the 1970s and 1980s with the themes of the Reformation in the cities and the Reformation of the « common man » sparked extensive scrutiny of the many *Flugschriften* that accompanied the initial effervescence of the Reformation movement in the belief that these would serve to lay bare the convictions, hopes, and dreams that ignited it. In French Reformation studies, the cultural turn sparked by Denis Crouzet's *Les guerriers de Dieu* served to encourage the study of widely circulating texts of all sorts. The books under review here show that a great deal has been learned in the past decades about the propagation and reception of evangelical or Protestant ideas in France. They also suggest that while the study of this area has now become an established part of the normal science of Reformation studies, it has not entered as successfully into dialogue with broader debates in the field as might be wished.

Of the five books for review here, Andrew Pettegree's *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* is the broadest in scope and ambition. For the past decade, Pettegree has been the driving force behind the St Andrews French Vernacular Book Project, which began as a census of religious printing in the vernacular and gradually evolved into a full short-title catalogue of all French-language books

[3] Throughout this essay, the term « evangelical » will be used to denote all views that called for a reform of faith and worship based upon a recovery of the Bible. Not all evangelicals in this sense broke with Rome, although many did. In France, those who did referred to themselves as « évangélistes » even as their enemies began to call them « calvinistes » or « huguenots ». Thus my definition is a broad one, to be distinguished from other usages that apply the concept exclusively to the early period of pre-confessional *Wildwuchs* or to those who sought reform without breaking with Rome.

published in the sixteenth century based upon the investigation of over 500 libraries[4]. While Pettegree's interpretation of the mechanics of religious communication is clearly shaped by this project, and while he integrates some of its lessons into *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*, this book is anything but a summary of its findings. Rather, it is a broad interpretive essay about the dissemination of Reformation ideas across western Europe, aimed at both undergraduate students and a broad scholarly audience, that is strikingly devoid of special pleading for the signal importance of books. Roughly three quarters of the work is devoted to surveying the full range of media by which evangelical ideas circulated. Sermons, songs, plays, and the graphic arts each receive their due before the printed word is even taken up. That the Reformation movement became most powerful when song, speech, and print all worked together in a mutually reinforcing process is perhaps the central argument of the book.

Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion also aspires to revise downward the importance that has been accorded graphic propaganda ever since the appearance of Bob Scribner's influential 1981 *For the Sake of Simple Folk: Popular Propaganda for the German Reformation*[5]. Scribner argued that, given the limited literacy rates of the early sixteenth century, the woodcuts produced in such quantities amid the first flush of the German Reformation constitute particularly important sources for understanding how the Reformation was communicated to the common man. Pettegree responds with three arguments. First, in an age of malnutrition and costly eyeglasses, many people would have seen the world through such blunted sight that they probably could not even observe the finer details of prints and pictures whose interpretation so delights modern art historians. Second, the scarcity of visual material in early propaganda for the French and Dutch Reformations suggests that the graphic arts were not necessary instruments of the communication process by which evangelical ideas spread to ordinary folk. Third, the great majority of woodcuts were so complex and allusive that they could only be deciphered and understood by those who already had substantial exposure to other forms of Reformation propaganda. Visual polemic in his view chiefly offered «in-jokes for the literate» (p. 114). «Our appreciation of Reformation art may increase our understanding of the range of visual edification available for members of the new church to articulate their identity. It is hard to see it as a primary instrument of conversion» (p. 127).

As an interpretive essay and book for classroom use, *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* has many virtues. Rich in information and anecdote, it offers a lively summary of recent work based on wide reading It is also truly international in scope, unlike so many general treatments of the European Reformation that focus primarily on Germany. Netherlandish, French, and English examples are adduced as frequently as German ones, and the overall account of the communication process that drove the Reformation accommodates the different pattern of the movement's growth in each of these regions. As the previous paragraph has made clear, the book is also bracingly argumentative. A few

---

4 The catalogue is expected to be published this year by IDC/Brill.

5 R. W. Scribner, *For the Sake of Simple Folk: Popular Propaganda for the German Reformation* (Cambridge, 1981; 2nd edition with a postscript by the author, Oxford, 1994).

of its suggestions, notably that about «the world through blunted eyesight», seem to be little more than the devices that experienced lecturers insert into their teaching now and then to wake up sleepy undergraduates. More generally, the attempt to downgrade the importance of graphic propaganda may go too far. It is surely more than coincidence than when five journeymen walking one Sunday in 1557 in the vineyards outside Troyes and reading aloud from evangelical books had the misfortune of coming across two royal sergeants out shooting pigeons, one of the two «little books» that they were found to have been looking at after they were arrested was a picture book, the *Antithese des faits de Jesus Christ et du Pape*[6]. Pictures lent themselves particularly well to the kind of group discussion and explanation that we know to have been a common feature of sixteenth-century artisan reading practices. Furthermore, their message was often clear even to those who could not read the accompanying explanatory text; when it was not, a picture posted in public could incite the illiterate to seek an explanation from those who could read. Pettegree is undoubtedly right to highlight that graphic propaganda achieved much of its power from being located within a wider system of communication that drew upon several media, just as he is to assert that illustrated works were only a drop in the bucket of Protestant pamphleteering during the flood tide of Reformed expansion in France and the Netherlands. But since the Protestant cause was ultimately less successful in these areas than in image-saturated Germany, where graphic artists were far thicker on the ground prior to the Reformation and quickly lent their skills to the evangelical cause, it is likely that many specialists will continue to believe in the power of images as weapons in the era's doctrine wars.

While stimulating and informative, *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* also suffers from one major flaw: it proposes an account of the Protestantism's persuasive power that is surprisingly silent about just what it was in the movement's doctrines or rhetoric that persuaded people to cast their lot with it. Its opening lines pose just the questions that recent international scholarship invites students of Reformation propaganda to investigate: «Why did people choose the Reformation? What was it in the evangelical teaching that excited, moved or persuaded them? How, and by what process, did people arrive at the new understandings that prompted a change of allegiance, and embedded them in their new faith?» (p.1). A brief first chapter offers a schematic diagram of the Protestant conversion process that suggests that people moved from awareness of the cause to identification with it, understanding of it, and finally activism on its behalf. As the book advances, however, it becomes primarily a history of different media and their use, not an account of the process of persuasion and mobilization. Individual texts are not analyzed closely to reveal the arguments and rhetorical strategies that might have made them particularly convincing or moving. Quantitative examination of the relative importance of different motifs of the sort that has been so central to much of the best work on this topic in German Reformation studies is eschewed. Chapter seven «Pamphlets and persuasion», returns, as its title suggests, to the problem of persuasion, but it explicitly downplays the actual content

---

[6] Nicolas Pithou de Chamgobert, *Chronique de Troyes et de la Champagne durant les guerres de Religion (1524-1594)* ed. Pierre-Eugène Leroy (Reims, 1998), I, 182-3.

of the printed works. Its central argument is that the key periods when Protestant ideas coalesced into powerful mass movements were «pamphlet moments» when the very multiplication of tracts enabled them to take on «a different life from their status as individual texts». «The superabundance, the cascade of titles... created an impression of an overwhelming tide, an unstoppable movement of opinion.» Their force lay less in their contents than «in the power – or appearance – of collective, irresistible might». (p. 163) The final chapters move on to a discussion of how different media were used to reinforce confessional identities in the wake of the Reformation. For all of the interest of the material synthesized here about the history of different media and their deployment in the Reformation, can a work that pays so little attention to the argument and rhetoric of the most widely circulating forms of the Protestant message fully answer the question of how and why that message excited and persuaded early converts?

Le livre réformé au XVI^e siècle is also a work of synthesis, but it is focused on a single medium, the printed book, and a single linguistic region, francophone Europe. It is composed of three chapters originally given as the Léopold Delisle lectures at the Bibliothèque nationale de France. A brief introduction and conclusion flank these. An appendix of six graphs provides curves of sixteenth-century Geneva book production, using the data base of Geneva, Lausanne, and Neuchâtel imprints that Gilmont has been compiling for much of his life[7].

A self-described «historien bibliographe», Gilmont began his career as a historian of the book-as-material-object, but has come with time to devote attention to reading as well as describing the books he studies. Much of *Le livre réformé au XVI^e siècle* focuses on the role of printers and the constraints under which they worked. Quantitative data about publishing trends are far more central here than in *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*. They are also analyzed with a new statistical wrinkle: in addition to counting editions, Gilmont computes the volume of typographic production each year by calculating the number of sheets of paper printed. Yet *Le livre réformé au XVI^e siècle* also attends to the contents of the books it discusses. Indeed, it sketches an important new view of the internal politics and theological evolution of early French Protestantism, one that seeks to respect the diversity of ideas within the movement and to break free from the distorting vision imposed retrospectively by a Genevan historiography that tended to cast all who saw the light of the Gospel between 1517 and 1560 as sharing the same proto-Reformed convictions.

Chapter one, devoted to the «voies multiples et discrètes» through which evangelical books were produced before 1540, covers ground already well surveyed in the work of Francis Higman[8]. At the same time, it develops some

---

[7] This «GLN 15-16» data base will soon be available in searchable form on the website of the just rebaptized Bibliothèque de Genève (formerly known as the Bibliothèque Publique et Universitaire).

[8] See Higman, *Censorship and the Sorbonne: A Bibliographical Study of Books in French Censured by the Faculty of Theology of the University of Paris, 1520-1551* (Geneva, 1979); idem, *Piety and the People: Religious Printing in France, 1511-1551* (Aldershot, 1996); idem, *Lire et découvrir. La circulation des idées au temps de la Réforme* (Geneva, 1998), and especially the outstanding synthetic essay «Le domaine français (1520-1562)» in Jean-François Gilmont ed., *La Réforme et le livre* (Paris, 1990), pp. 105-154.

original points of emphasis and benefits from the findings of recent research, most notably that collected in *Le livre évangélique en français avant Calvin*, which Gilmont was in the midst of co-editing when he spoke in Paris. During these first two decades of the French Reformation, Alençon, Paris, Lyon, Antwerp, Neuchâtel, Strasbourg, and Basel all emerged briefly as important centers of evangelical printing in French. Geneva only came on line in 1536, when Guillaume Farel convinced the Waldensian barbe Jean Girard to set up the first press there. The 181 editions of evangelical books that have now been identified and inventoried for the years 1523-1539 ranged from Bibles to devotional works touched by Erasmian, Fabrist, and Lutheran influences to polemical tracts of an outspokenly anti-Papal and sacramentarian character. Gilmont's account draws attention to the importance of Louis Berquin as an early translator of works by Erasmus, Luther, Melanchthon, and von Hutten; to the links connecting the printing shops of Simon Du Bois, the important evangelical printer inside France protected by Marguerite of Navarre, and Martin Lempereur, who worked in Antwerp; and finally to the importance of the «groupe de Neuchâtel» that emerged between 1531 and 1535 around the printer Pierre de Vingle. The members of this «bande de joyeux lurons» (p. 31) included Antoine Marcourt, Guillaume Farel, Thomas Malingre, Pierre Robert Olivétan, Antoine Saunier, Pierre Viret, Antoine Froment, Marie Dentière, Jean Le Comte, and Bonaventure Des Périers. Together, they took French evangelicalism in an anti-sacramentarian direction that ultimately triggered the crackdown that followed the Affair of the Placards and shattered the hopes for moderate change from inside the Catholic church that had arisen in 1533-1534. The Genevan *Histoire ecclesiastique des Eglises reformées au royaume de France* would later speak disapprovingly of the «indiscreet zeal» of those of this group who unwisely posted the placards throughout France.

The two decades that followed, dominated by Genevan printers and the voice of Calvin, are the subject of chapter two. In the course of the 1540s Calvin broke off contact with Marguerite of Navarre and began to denounce temporisers and Nicodemites. In Gilmont's telling of the story, he also began to display his mistrust of a number of reformers labelled here as «radicals», especially those connected to the Neuchâtel group. In order to get rid of a printer, Jean Michel, too closely linked to the group, he actively worked to undermine Michel's projects. Over the subsequent decades he used his influence over the control and censorship of what was published to favor friendly printers and weaken others. With his aid, an interconnected group of entrepreneurs and printers around Laurent de Normandie, Robert Estienne and Conrad Badius came to dominate the most lucrative sectors of what grew over these decades into a much larger and more varied printing sector. Between 1541 and 1564, Genevan publishers produced more pages of Calvin than of the Bible, even though the production of Bibles also rose rapidly in this period. Calvin's works accounted for 28 per cent of Genevan titles and 30 per cent of sheets printed during these years; Bibles 14 per cent of titles and 26 per cent of sheets printed. The next most extensively printed authors lagged far behind. They were Viret (5 per cent of all printed pages), Marlorat (4 per cent), Sleidan (3.5 per cent), and the authors of the *Magdeburg Centuries* (3 per cent) (pp. 48, 55).

Chapter three, «After Calvin», covers the years 1559-1598 and is divided roughly equally between Protestant printing within France and the evolution of

Genevan publishing. The dramatic multiplication of Reformed churches in France after 1559, the toleration granted the cause after 1560-62 (albeit with ever-changing restrictions and intermittent revocations), and the hopes that flourished briefly in the early 1560s that the cause might even triumph brought forth a bevy of Protestant printers within the kingdom. Gilmont offers here the first survey of these printers and their activity, the full scale of which has been gradually revealed over the past half century by the work of Eugénie Droz, Louis Desgraves, Geneviève Guilleminot, and now the St Andrews Vernacular Book Project[9]. The years 1560-1565 were the high point of activity for these men, as presses in Lyon, Paris, Caen, Rouen, Orléans, St Lô, and Sedan began to produce works for the cause. But this period of intense activity soon ended as hope for the cause faded and Protestantism's strength waned in the kingdom's largest cities. After the St Bartholomew's Massacre, Protestant printing within France was only kept alive by small presses in a few strongholds in the South and West, notably La Rochelle, Montauban, and Béarn. The years of intense activity between 1560 and 1565 nonetheless reveal the persistence within French Protestantism of a range of currents and aspirations at variance with those propagated from Geneva. Some of the pamphlets and songs produced in Lyon during the period of Huguenot domination breathe a militancy that far exceeds anything produced in Geneva. Publishers such as Claude Senneton ensured that the alternative ecclesiology of Jean Morély and the moderate, mystical writings of Juan Valdes, both viewed with still greater distaste by Calvin and Beza, found their way into print. In Geneva itself, the output of the city's presses fell from its first peak of 4300 sheets in 1562 to just 1100 in 1574. A substantial recovery followed, and by the last decade of the century Genevan production was as high or higher than it had been in 1560-1562. But this recovery came on new foundations. Scholarly works in Latin now supplanted the production of religious books in French as the chief product of the city's presses. Bibles consumed just 7 per cent of the sheets of paper printed in the city, Calvin's works 5, and Beza's 2.

Where *Le livre réformé au XVI^e siècle* offers a rich distillate of the past generations' research, *Le livre évangélique en français avant Calvin* takes us to the hard rock face, where scholars chip away previously undiscovered nuggets of ore. This collective volume is a work of erudition in the tradition of *Aspects de la propagande religieuse*, yet more narrowly focused. As the subtitle informs us, it offers new editions (specifically, of the anonymous *Epistre chrestienne tresu-*

---

[9] Eugénie Droz, *Barthélemy Berton, 1563-1573* (Geneva, 1960); idem, *Le Veuve Berton et Jean Portau, 1573-1589* (Geneva, 1960); Louis Desgraves, *Les Haultin, 1571-1623* (Geneva, 1960); idem, *Eloi Gibier, imprimeur à Orléans (1536-1588)* (Geneva, 1966); Gilmont, «Eloi Gibier, éditeur de théologie réformée: nouveau complément à la bibliographie de ses éditions», *BHR*, 47, 1985, pp. 395-403; Geneviève Guilleminot, «Religion et politique à la veille des guerres civiles. Recherches sur les impressions françaises de l'année 1561» (thèse de l'Ecole des Chartes, 1977); Andrew Pettegree, «Protestantism, Publication and the French Wars of Religion: The Case of Caen» in Robert J. Bast and Andrew C. Gow eds., *Continuity and Change: The Harvest of Late Medieval and Reformation History* (Leiden, 2000), pp. 163-79; idem, «Protestant Printing during the French Wars of Religion: The Lyon Press of Jean Saugrain» in Thomas A. Brady Jr. et al eds., *The Work of Heiko A. Oberman* (Leiden, 2003), pp. 109-29.

tile and of the oldest edition of a psalm translated by Clément Marot) and bibliographic catalogues (of the publications of Pierre de Vingle) as well as original scholarly essays. A few titles will convey the character of most of these last: «Marguerite of Navarre's Illuminated Evangelical Cathechism and Confession (Arsenal, MS 5096)», «La production typographique de Martin Lempereur», «L'*Epistre* de Marie d'Ennetieres et les dédicaces évangéliques offertes à la famille royale avant 1540». Despite the narrow and often technical focus of many contributions, the volume as a whole adds up to a coherent, instructive, and successful collective work because the studies offer complementary approaches to a clearly defined topic, and because the more interpretive and exegetical essays draw out some implications of the drier bibliographical contributions. The final chapter of the book is a broad synthetic essay by Gilmont, «En guise de conclusion: le livre évangélique de langue française avant Calvin», that is a prior iteration of chapter 1 of *Le livre réformé au XVI^e siècle*.

Some of the most valuable contributions within this volume are those that shed light on the different currents of opinion within early French evangelicalism through detailed explorations of the contents of individual works. René Paquin's study of the anonymous *L'exhortation à la lecture des saintes lettres*, published by Etienne Dolet in 1542 and burned on the steps of Notre Dame in 1544, reveals this text to have been an amalgam of several earlier works, including Erasmus's introduction to the paraphrases of the New Testament. Justification by faith is emphasized, but the work is silent about the mass, purgatory, papal power, the invocation of the saints, and the number of the sacraments. Primarily a work of contemplative spirituality, it calls on believers to amend their ways by ascending from virtue to virtue. The portion of the book copied from Erasmus has one telling excision. The statement in the original that we should not debate about how Christ's body is contained in the bread of the sacrament but just believe it has been removed, indicating the author's desire to distance him- or herself from the doctrine of the real presence. Far more outspoken is the attack on the mass in Guillaume Farel's *Sommaire et briefve declaration d'aucuns lieux fort necessaires à ung chascun Chrestien*, first published by Pierre de Vingle in Lyon in 1529 and reprinted three more times by 1534. As analyzed here by Francis Higman, it marks the moment of transition from Farel's early teaching texts to a more belligerent attack on the mass and the church of Rome that depicts the invention of the mass as the origin of ecclesiastical aggrandizement. «Par la messe, les paovres sont destruictz, les vefves aussi et orphelines: car par elle l'eglise du pape a tiré tous les biens du monde» (p. 81).

One of several contributions signed by William Kemp takes as its point of departure the epigraph «lisez et puis jugez» found on the title page of a number of early Neuchâtel imprints. Scribner once memorably called the doctrine of the priesthood of all believers a «lost doctrine of the Reformation» because it disappeared so rapidly after 1525[10]. Kemp shows that it endured in francophone propaganda beyond that date and proved compelling to some. An epigraph similar to «lisez et puis jugez» appeared on the title page of several works of

[10] R.W. Scribner, «Politics and the Institutionalisation of Reform in Germany», *The New Cambridge Modern History, vol. 2, 1520-1559* (2nd ed., Cambridge, 1990), pp. 181-2.

Luther's as early as 1518, not to mention works by Erasmus, Zell, Bucer. It recurred on the cover of a number of Strasbourg, Antwerp and Neuchâtel French imprints down to 1535. When the 1534 placards against the mass were posted in Geneva and drew a crowd of people, many of whom clamored to have them torn down, the *secrétaire du conseil* Claude Roset urged them to be left up so that people could read them and make up their own minds. Another councillor immediately punched him angrily for saying this. In contributions and vignettes such as this we see the diversity of ideas circulating at this period and the passions they could arouse.

An especially important article by Isabelle Denommé analyzes fifteen works of the 1530s, most of them published by de Vingle in Neuchâtel, in order to illuminate the concerns and preoccupations of the « groupe de Neuchâtel ». The central Reformation doctrines of *sola fide* and *sola scriptura* both appear often. Frequent citations of John 4:24, « Dieu est esperit et fault que ceulx qui l'adorent l'adorent en esperit et en verité », reveal an Erasmian and Fabrist focus on religion as a matter of the spirit. Knowledge of God and His commandments comes solely through the Bible, « a laquelle du tout se fault arrester sans y rien adjouster ou diminuer ». Transubstantiation, the mass as sacrifice, and the real presence are all strongly rejected; the eucharistic elements « signifie et represente » Christ's body and blood. The attack on the Catholic clergy is unsparing. Indulgences, pardons, and other « meschantes ydolatries » are nothing but clerical invention « pour piller et desrober le pauvre peuple ». The Pope is the Antichrist, « un droit diable », « un loup meurtrier, fier et haultain ». Clerical sexual immorality is a particular subject of predilection, attacked no less than thirty times. Withal, all obedience is due the secular authorities, whose power comes directly from God. Except for the matter of the eucharist, where Calvin would argue for a symbolic real presence, there is little in the doctrines set forth here with which the Genevan reformer would disagree. Gilmont's depiction of the Neuchâtel group as significantly more « radical » than Calvin may be a bit too hasty or elliptical. The difference between them – to the extent that the Neuchâtel authors can be considered to form a unified group – appears have been less a matter of doctrine than of rhetoric and tone, with the Neuchâtel authors preferring blunt, prolix anti-clerical invective, where Calvin mocked the folly of those blind to the clear word of God in his more concise, elegant prose[11]. It is undeniable, however, that the outspokenness of the attack on the mass, the clergy, and the Pope emanating from Neuchâtel distinguished the authors active here from other French evangelicals at the time and polarized religious debate just at a moment when the

[11] This, at least, is suggested by the studies of O. Millet, « Calvin pamphlétaire » in *Le pamphlet en France au XVI^e siècle*, Cahiers V.L. Saulnier 1 (Paris, 1983), pp. 9-22; and Geneviève Gross, « Les rééditions du *Livre des Marchans* de 1541 et 1544: un livre à double enjeu », *Institut d'Histoire de la Réformation: Bulletin Annuel*, 26 (2004-2005), pp. 45-58, esp. pp. 54-6. We will be far better equipped to explore the rhetorical and doctrinal similarities and differences between Geneva and the Neuchâtel authors once three editorial projects now underway are completed: Geneviève Gross's edition of the *Livre des Marchands*; William Kemp and Diane Desrosier-Bonin's republication of the corpus of texts published by de Vingle in Neuchâtel between 1533 and 1535; and the collaborative project to edit the published works of Guillaume Farel directed by Reinhard Bodenmann.

more moderate evangelicals around the court of Francis I were obtaining a growing measure of influence.

Another collective volume, *Les deux réformes chrétiennes. Propagation et diffusion*, is the product of a very different kind of conference from that which gave rise to *Le livre évangélique en français avant Calvin*. Where the latter grew out of a small topic-driven gathering held in Sherbrooke, Quebec in 1999, *Les deux réformes chrétiennes* was born from two larger prestige-driven conferences held in Haifa in 2000 and 2001. Eminent senior historians, musicologists, and literary scholars, primarily Paris- or Geneva-based, were invited to address the dissemination of reform movements in the Protestant and the Catholic Reformations. As is typical of such events, some brought the fruits of their latest research more or less germane to the theme. Others dug into old research notes to find material that could fit within the conference parameters. The result is a grab-bag of 26 essays, all but two in French, loosely organized under rubrics such as «Réforme et Contre-Réforme Militantes», «Idéologie et Comportement», «Arts et Representation». Six explore Protestant images, texts, or collections of texts; two examine works of Catholic controversialists; two look at Protestant practices of psalm- or hymn-singing; two at institutional instruments of Catholic reform; the others spread themselves out across topics ranging from Montaigne's observations about the diversity of religious practices encountered on his travels through Germany and Switzerland to the regulation of dress during the Catholic Reformation. Most deal with France, although studies devoted to Belgium, Holland, Italy, Spain, Silesia, and Ethiopia also appear between these covers.

The price of this miscellany is a whopping 139 euros (189 dollars), an illustration of the perverse economics of scholarly publishing at the dawn of the twenty-first century. Library budgets worldwide are stretched ever tighter because of the spiraling costs of serials and growing volume of monographs. Despite this, the number of volumes of conference papers also continues to grow, even as leading journals have an increasingly hard time filling their pages with important articles by established scholars. While it would have been far more cost-effective to fill up two or three issues of *The Sixteenth Century Journal* or the *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* with the publication-worthy essays in this book, there is little likelihood that the proliferation of volumes like this will stop any time soon. For more senior scholars, conference invitations provide a confirmation and enhancement of their status, the opportunity to travel to interesting places, and the promise of publication without the lengthy and potentially embarrassing process of submitting their work for peer review. Conference organizers are eager to publish the acts of their conference as a record of their activity. Publishers like Brill have evidently found that a profit can be made on such volumes if the price is set high enough[12].

[12] The series in which this book appears, Studies in the History of Christian Traditions, illustrates perfectly both the publishing inflation of the past half century and the proliferation of essay collections. In the series' first decade of existence, 1966-1975, 12 books appeared under its aegis, including one volume of collected essays. In the past decade, 51 books appeared in the series, including 11 essay collections. Needless to say, the quality of the books has not kept pace with the growth of the series.

Three essays within this volume contribute particularly noteworthy theses or findings relevant to our theme of Protestantism, persuasion, and propaganda. Denis Crouzet offers a characteristically suggestive reading of Calvin's writings and actions, which he analyzes as a single corpus (and without footnotes). At the heart of Calvin's religious vision, he suggests, was a view that the Catholic church, with its false teachings, bred a perverse fear in its followers. Told that they could never be assured of their salvation, they were driven to engage in a series of propitiatory actions that actually revealed their hatred of God, since these actions did not follow His own commandments, and suggested that believers lacked confidence that He could save them through the force of His own love and sacrifice. The strength of Calvin's message, which arose from his own personal experience of conversion, was to replace this « bad fear » with a good one, one that dreaded the force of sin in the world and fought ceaselessly against it, as well as against all who threatened the divine message and order, in the service of a God gracious enough to have ensured the faithful's salvation. Some may wonder if this does not yield a Calvin who looks an awful lot like Luther – indeed, the Luther of Luther's own retrospective autobiographical self-portrayal. In any event, for Crouzet « La force probable du message calviniste fut qu'il se constitua en une révolution herméneutique qui avait une capacité de séduction libératrice dans la mesure où, dans la mémoire de ce qui a pu être un dramatique parcours personnel, il inversait les mécanismes de fonctionnement de l'imaginaire et de sa grammaire » (pp. 21-2). Those who have followed the evolution of Crouzet's scholarship may find this a slight modification of, or at least shift of focus from, his 1990 *Les guerriers de Dieu*, which located the kernel of Calvinism's appeal in the liberation that the doctrine of predestination offered from the eschatological anxieties that he believed to be so strong in sixteenth-century France. Presumably this adjustment of focus results from his more intense engagement with Calvin's life and writing as a consequence of preparing a biography of the reformer[13].

Cities throughout Christendom competed with one another to draw the best preachers for the great cycle of Lenten sermons that were one of the central features of the Catholic ritual year. Marc Venard offers a preliminary survey of known cases where French preachers used Lenten sermons to broadcast heterodox opinions. The cases that he has located cluster in two decades, the 1520s and the 1540s, and are numerous enough to suggest that this was an important channel through which evangelical ideas spread during these decades. In only a minority of instances do the sources reveal the contents of the sermons that set off alarm bells among the defenders of orthodoxy. It nonetheless appears that changes occurred between the two decades. In the 1520s Pierre de Sébiville at Grenoble preached against required fast times, clerical celibacy, and the reservation of the eucharistic wine for the clergy. In the 1540s Francois Landry found himself in hot water in Paris for denying the existence of purgatory, while Claude d'Espence ran afoul of the Sorbonne for upholding the doctrine of justification by faith, declaring that clerical celibacy could be eliminated by a church council, asserting that the *Golden Legend* was a tissue of errors, criticizing the

[13] Denis Crouzet, *Jean Calvin vies parallèles* (Paris, 2000).

view that daily attendance at mass guaranteed salvation, and denying that clergymen had a distinctive, superior status. At Courthézon in the principality of Orange in 1544, Raphael de Podio denied the real presence and the existence of purgatory. Prayers for the dead, pilgrimages, holy water and kneeling before images of the saints were useless, he added. The difference in outlook between Espence, who vehemently denied ever questioning the real presence, and Podio, who emphatically did, must be highlighted; different currents of opinion are visible here. Between the 1520s and the 1540s, however, the range of criticisms of the established church had widened and direct attacks on the mass and the doctrine of the real presence had begun.

Jean-François Gilmont also contributes valuably to this volume, this time with an essay that addresses the question central to Pettegree's *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*: what forms of communication were particularly important for the early spread of the Reformation? The geographic region chosen for investigation encompasses France and Wallonia. The sources employed are the *Histoire des martyrs*, the *Histoire ecclesiastique des Eglises réformées au royaume de France*, the *Correspondance des Réformateurs dans les pays de langue française* for the years 1524 and 1534, a number of local chronicles, and the detailed record of the 1534 Lyon trial of Baudichon de La Maisonneuve that has also been the subject of an important article by William Naphy[14]. This corpus by no means offers a complete survey of the evidence about Protestantism's spread, but because it is a fixed corpus it can be sifted to determine the relative frequency with which different channels for the communication of heterodox ideas appear. Gilmont finds that books were virtually the sole vehicle of the first penetration of Luther's ideas into French-speaking regions; all of the earliest reports of the circulation of Lutheran doctrines here allude to the dissemination of his books. From 1523-1524 onward, the evidence of heresy trials also begins to reveal cases of preachers pursued for expressing heterodox opinions from the pulpit. An isolated instance from 1524 involved the posting of a placard. Over the subsequent decades, sermons and books continue to emerge as the most important vectors of heterodoxy. Conventicles or discussion groups appear as a third important channel for change from 1541 onward. Gilmont's corpus yields just one reference to songs and none to prints, the theatre, or poetic competitions.

The vignettes that Gilmont analyzes in this study are pertinent and revealing, but they tend to be brief. In the case of the *Histoire des martyrs* and the *Histoire ecclesiastique des Eglises réformées au royaume de France*, they have also been filtered through an editing process that often reshaped and condensed the original memoranda on which these works were based. One of the strengths of Clive Griffin's fascinating *Journeymen-Printers, Heresy, and the Inquisition in Sixteenth-Century Spain* is the unusually sharp light that it is able to cast on the dissemination and reception of Protestant ideas among artisans thanks to the extensive Inquisition trial transcripts on which it rests. These sources, of course, also have their filters. Rare is the person who did not speak guardedly before an inquisitor. As so many previous studies have already shown, however, no other

[14] Naphy, «Catholic Perceptions of Early French Protestantism: The Heresy Trial of Baudichon de La Maisonneuve in Lyon», *French History*, 9 (1995), 451-77.

source from this era contains as much detail about the lives and beliefs of otherwise anonymous individuals. Griffin, an Oxford hispanist whose previous book was a history of the Cromberger press in Seville, has found enough cases of foreign printing workers summoned before the Holy Office for heresy between 1569 and 1572 to shed fascinating light on the beliefs and behavior of humble artisans drawn into the orbit of the French Reformation.

The full scope of *Journeymen-Printers, Heresy, and the Inquisition* encompasses all three subjects evoked by its title: the functioning of the Inquisition; the lives and work patterns of the itinerant journeymen attracted to Spain because of its relatively high wages and paucity of native printing workers; and the religious convictions that got some of these men and women in hot water. Thanks to the detail of the sources and Griffin's skill as a storyteller, the suspects who appear most often in the successive chapters emerge vividly as personalities: the strong-willed Isabel Regnier, who wielded considerable authority within her husband's printing shop and did not hesitate to mock the Papist superstitions she saw everywhere around her; the tippler Hendrik van der Loe, whose weakness for drink may have been intensified by the guilt he felt at having to conceal his faith; the quickly intimidated Juan Franco, rendered distraught by worry about what would happen to his pregnant wife and four children while he languished in the Inquisition's jails. What the volume reveals about the workings of the Inquisition can at times be heart-breaking. As an ecclesiastical tribunal concerned to bring sinners to repentance, the court treated cases of false confession especially harshly. It also used its considerable discretionary powers to convey strong messages of deterrence when it believed the faith was in danger. Poor Franco, against whom the inquisitors had little evidence when he was first arrested, was condemned to eight years in the galleys and the loss of all his possessions after he first confessed that he had advised a young man too poor to purchase a dispensation to eat meat on Friday to do so anyway, then – fatal mistake – attempted to deny this. Among his goods seized and sold were his youngest child's cradle and pillow. The study also illuminates social relations within Spain's printing industry and the extraordinary mobility of many journeyman printers. But perhaps the most fascinating chapters of the book – certainly the key ones for present purposes – are those dedicated to the attitudes, beliefs, and customs of the printing workers. Here the trial testimony both reveals the circuits by which heretical ideas reached these workers and illuminates what different individuals made of these ideas.

Joao de Leao claimed to have learned the heresies to which he confessed from a book that he had read while serving as a soldier in Picardy, the *Fontaine de la vie*. This work is a compilation of Bible passages and summary of doctrine of a sort typical of early French evangelicalism. By comparing it with the views to which de Leao confessed, Griffin is able to show that the extent of his errors in fact went well beyond those contained in this work, so he must have absorbed many of his convictions at other moments in his wide travels and many conversations, notwithstanding his subsequent reconstruction of the evolution of his ideas before his judges. Griffin's broader conclusion expands the point: « However great the printing-workers' respect for writing, we find that they had acquired their convictions entirely or in part orally: through listening, discussion, and, occasionally, through the interaction of the written and the spoken

word» (p. 244). This is not to say that books were unimportant. Some printing workers eagerly read the pages of doctrinal works as they came off the presses. Like the journeymen surprised outside Troyes in 1557, a group of Protestant playing card makers working in Toledo went out into the vineyards around that city on days off to listen to one of their number read aloud from evangelical writings, in this instance a work by Calvin smuggled into the country. One member of their group also owned a miniature copy of the psalms. But sermons, group conversations, and the reinforcement provided by group singing were still more important in bringing them to their convictions and reinforcing them. Sermons heard years before were often clearly recalled. More than one printing worker sang psalms while setting type or pulling on the presses, despite the evident danger of doing so in Spain. Proofreaders, typically the most educated individuals in a printing shop, were besieged with questions about doctrinal matters from those with less formal education. The circulation of Protestant ideas in Spain also included at least one case (in Toledo in 1559) where anti-Papal verses were publicly posted. Polemical images were rare but had considerable shock value: the crackdown that led to the arrest of one important smuggler of Protestant books began when a recipient of one of his books opened it to a woodcut illustrating Bernardino Ochino's *Imagen del Antichristo* showing the pope kneeling to receive a document from the devil – a woodcut recycled from the *Antithèse des faits de Jesus Christ et du Pape*, the work the Troyes journeymen were inspecting when they were arrested in 1557.

When the trial testimony appears to yield reliable evidence about the personal convictions of those interrogated, these convictions turn out to vary in both content in degree of doctrinal abstraction. After Giles Duse could no longer bear the guilt he felt at having denied his beliefs in an earlier trial, he forthrightly told his judges:

> I hold that in order to be saved all we need is faith and belief in God alone. The true body of Our Lord Jesus Christ is not present in the consecrated host, which is just a commemoration. The true body of Christ sits in flesh and blood on the right hand of the Father, not in the host. I know full well that I shall be burnt for my beliefs, but nothing will convince me that I am wrong. There's no such thing as purgatory. The mass was invented just to trick the dying into ordering masses to be said for their souls in purgatory; this is the origin of the mass, and it is all a swindle to rob people of their money. We should look to the passion of Christ to purge our sins when we die, because we cannot gain salvation through any good works of our own. St Paul says that everything that is held to be good in this life is considered in heaven to be worthless. The only true church resides in men's own hearts. What I believe is the Gospel-truth and is to be found in the Good Book. If Your Honours let me have a copy of the New Testament in Flemish, I'll show you the source of all I believe, for everything else is a snare and a delusion. (p. 223)

Such a concise, well elaborated statement of core Reformed doctrines was relatively rare. Many of those interrogated grew increasingly confused as the questioning moved into more abstract theological waters. Others insisted that they accepted certain Catholic teachings while rejecting others. Nadal Radix was accused of a kind of common-sense materialism with no clear Protestant coloration: «birth and death are all there is; the only difference between a man and a chicken is the way they are born and the way they die» (p 230). For most of

those who appear here, Protestant conviction appears to have meant above all the rejection of some Catholic worship practices and engagement in alternative forms of worship or sociability. The themes that appear most frequently in the accusations and confessions involve the mockery or denial of the Pope's authority and of such practices as pilgrimages, obligatory fasting, the cult of Mary and the saints, the veneration of images, indulgences, and (less consistently) the doctrine of the real presence and cult of the Holy Sacrament. (pp. 140, 151, 217-27, 233). Among themselves, the «*luteranos*» complained of living in «Babylon» and dreamed of living in «freedom», by which they meant freedom from having to participate in idolatrous Roman rites. Even though they had known before coming to Spain that, as a saying went, survival there required keeping one's mouth and one's purse shut, having to conform outwardly to Catholic practices came to weigh on many with time. After a while, some let down their guard in the wrong company and paid a heavy price. Calvin's denunciation of Nicodemism and the Reformed cult of martyrdom were not without influence.

As the books just surveyed show, research on the theme of Protestantism, print, and propaganda continues to advance impressively. The steady accumulation of bibliographic knowledge has filled out our picture of the universe of printed texts circulating in the years of the Reformation's growth. The careful analysis of more and more of these texts enriches our knowledge of the different currents of opinion they spread. As Griffin's book shows, the archival investigation of the world of the book trades still has new light to shed both on the convictions of those who produced these books and on the circuits of production and distribution followed by their products. Already fifty years ago, *Aspects de la propagande religieuse* acknowledged that books were not the sole vectors of heterodox ideas, for one of its chapters examined «Le collège, agent d'infiltration de la Réforme». More recent studies, well summarized in *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*, underscore still more clearly yet the importance, at least in certain parts of Europe, of sermons, songs, plays, and perhaps prints in the process of the movement's spread. The field is now beginning to generate its own revisionist debates. A priority for the next generation of scholars must clearly be to extend the search for traces of the role played by song, theatre, image, and poetic competition in the Reformation's spread, and to combine the study of different media in synthetic ways that reveal the similarities, differences, and points of contact between them.

At the same time, it would be unfortunate if work in this domain simply continued to move down the furrows that the past fifty year's of research has marked out. While historians of the book have deepened their investigation of established problems over the past five decades, they have not always noticed new debates of relevance to their work taking place within the broader world of Reformation scholarship. In particular, the subject of Protestantism's appeal to ordinary people has moved to the forefront of scholarly concerns in the past two generations. The literature devoted to the German Reformation has been marked by particularly vigorous and creative debates about just what part of the Protestant message resonated particularly strongly with men and women of all walks of life. A variety of hypotheses about this question have also been articulated with reference to France. The questions at stake are just those posed by Pettegree

at the outset of *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*: «Why did people choose the Reformation? What was it in the evangelical teaching that excited, moved or persuaded them?»

Recent historians of the French Reformation have located the core of the Protestant message in four different places. As already mentioned, Denis Crouzet's earlier writings emphasized the relief that Calvinist teachings, especially the doctrine of predestination, offered from the eschatological anxiety felt by so many at the time[15]. His chapter in *Les deux réformes chrétiennes* modifies this thesis in the direction of a *désangoissement* from the broader insecurity generated by late medieval Catholicism's emphasis that it was presumptuous for believers ever to assume that their salvation was certain. In either case, Crouzet equates the core of Calvinism's appeal in France with the core of Calvin's soteriological message: justification by faith alone and predestination.

Carlos Eire's important 1986 *War Against the Idols: The Reformation of Worship from Erasmus to Calvin* identified another constellation of doctrinal positions as the explosive kernel of the Reformed Protestant message[16]. God is spirit and must be worshipped in spirit. Any doctrine or practice that attributes a measure of holiness to material objects is erroneous and idolatrous. Those who have seen the light of Christian truth are obligated to withdraw from all idolatry. Here, according to Eire, are the key convictions that led first Swiss and then Francophone Protestants to a violent rupture with Rome. First tentatively articulated by Erasmus and Lefèvre d'Etaples, further elaborated by the leading Reformed theologians from Zwingli through Calvin, these ideas represented a frontal attack on the lived religion of ordinary Christians, since the cult of the saints and the worship of the Holy Sacrament were both central to popular devotion at the end of the Middle Ages. They also demanded a rupture with the church of Rome, unlike the doctrines of justification by faith alone and predestination. The particular strength of Eire's book is that he not only follows in detail the evolving theological critique of idolatry, but also examines the crowd agitation that accompanied the spread of the Reformation from Zurich to Geneva, demonstrating how intensely those who became caught up in the movement were exercised by the issue of idolatry, and how much crowd violence took the form of a war against the idols. Both Crouzet's *Guerriers de Dieu* and Olivier Christin's 1991 *Une révolution symbolique. L'iconoclasme huguenot et la reconstruction catholique* subsequently provided further evidence of just how widespread iconoclasm was in the French Reformation, although neither of these authors insisted as strongly as Eire on the centrality of this theme for understanding Reformed Protestantism's revolutionary implications and galvanizing potential[17].

---

[15] Denis Crouzet, *Les guerriers de Dieu. La violence au temps des troubles de religion (vers 1525-vers 1610)* (Seyssel, 1990), I, 135-153; idem, *Genèse de la Réforme française 1520-1562* (Paris, 1996), pp. 277-83.

[16] Eire, *War Against the Idols: The Reformation of Worship from Erasmus to Calvin* (Cambridge, 1986).

[17] Crouzet, *Guerriers de Dieu*, I, 495-605; Christin, *Une révolution symbolique. L'iconoclasme huguenot et la reconstruction catholique* (Paris, 1991), part 1.

For Christopher Elwood, the author of *The Body Broken : The Calvinist Doctrine of the Eucharist and the Symbolization of Power in Sixteenth-Century France* (1999), the Calvinist doctrine of the eucharist « created the environment that made social and political revolution possible ». Elwood quotes with approval the Catholic controversialist Gentian Hervet's 1562 remark that « wicked books... full of impiety and blasphemy against the Holy Mass » incited the French to revolt against their lord the king. No other theological issue, he maintains, arose more frequently in Protestant publications from the period 1540-1560[18]. The claim is not convincingly documented in his book, which is more purely theological in character than Eire's and omits any examination of the reception of the ideas that it explicates. Elwood's thesis is nonetheless one to reckon with. The sacramentarian negation of the real presence, whether in 1534 or in 1562, touched a nerve among those attached to the old faith in a way that few other aspects of the Protestant critique of Catholicism did. Frank Lestringant and Thierry Wanegffelen have likewise identified the eucharistic question as the one that polarized French opinion at the time as no other[19].

Henry Heller locates the central appeal of the Calvinist message in France in still another set of themes in his 1986 *The Conquest of Poverty: The Calvinist Revolt in Sixteenth Century France*[20]. For him, the doctrinal tenets of the faith were less important than the promise it offered the different strata of French society that their worsening economic situation might be alleviated by a reformation that would reduce the numbers of the clergy and redistribute church wealth. Subsequent scholars have tended to dismiss Heller's thesis because it is accompanied by an unpersuasive Marxist analysis of the sociology of the movement that numerous empirical studies have called into doubt. But the book may well deserve a second look from students of Protestant propaganda. A number of Huguenot manifestos, especially those written in 1561 after the crown convoked the Estates-General and appealed to the political nation to propose solutions to its fiscal crisis, urged the seizure of church wealth and its use to tackle problems ranging from excessive taxes to the inadequate compensation of the crown's most faithful servants[21]. Scattered bits of evidence suggest that a portion of the French peasantry understood the call to return to the pure Gospel as a justification for refusing to pay tithes or seigneurial dues[22]. Dreams of social or political

---

18 Christopher Elwood, *The Body Broken : The Calvinist Doctrine of the Eucharist and the Symbolization of Power in Sixteenth-Century France* (Oxford, 1999), pp. 4, 77, 81.

19 Frank Lestringant, *Une sainte horreur, ou le voyage en Eucharistie XVI^e-XVIII^e siècle* (Paris, 1996) ; Wanegffelen, *Ni Rome ni Genève. Des fidèles entre deux chaires en France au XVI^e siècle* (Paris, 1997), esp. pp. 17ff.

20 Heller, *The Conquest of Poverty: The Calvinist Revolt in Sixteenth Century France* (Leiden, 1986), esp. pp. 158, 220, 244.

21 See, for instance, the « Remonstrance en forme de requeste a la royne mere du roy, et au roy de Navarre » and the « Remonstrance sur la reformation des trois estats de France », reproduced in *Mémoires de Condé* (London, 1740), II, 546-60, 644-53.

22 Blaise de Monluc, *Commentaires* ed. Courteault (Paris, 1964), pp. 483-7 ; Paul Courteault, *Blaise de Monluc historien. Etude critique sur le texte et la valeur historique des Commentaires* (Paris, 1908), pp. 408-11 ; Arlette Jouanna et al., *Histoire et dictionnaire des*

transformation may also have accompanied and helped to advance the French Reformation.

For those familiar with the literature on the German Reformation, these different suggestions about where to locate the essence of Protestantism's appeal can be seen partially to replicate the debate that arose between 1962 and 1995 over the question of how to explain the extraordinary speed of the evangelical movement's expansion in the cities of Germany and Switzerland. Bernd Moeller's *Reichstadt und Reformation* launched this discussion, attributing Protestantism's rapid conquest of the great majority of Free Imperial Cities to the resonance of a call for collective moral renewal within cities where the late medieval ideal of the Christian community remained strong[23]. Thomas Brady exposed how poorly the ideal of community truly applied to the increasingly stratified and oligarchic cities of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, but Steven Ozment took the question in a new direction in his 1975 *The Reformation in the Cities*, where he argued that Luther's teaching of justification by faith alone appealed to the townsfolk of Germany and Switzerland because it liberated them from the tyranny of the confessional and from their anxiety about their ability to live up to the late medieval Christianity's demanding moral code[24]. Ozment's impressionistically supported emphasis on the centrality of *sola fide* gained more systematic support from Bernd Moeller's 1984 and 1996 studies of the contents of the earliest printed evangelical sermon summaries. In these works written by evangelical preachers for the benefit of towns from which they had been expelled, Moeller found, the theme of *sola fide* recurred more frequently than any other[25]. Other students of different forms of early evangelical propaganda, however, have been more impressed by the diversity of themes within the sermons, pamphlets, and prints of the period. They reject the claim that justification by faith alone was the cause's great rallying cry[26]. A particularly important contribution to this debate came from Hans-Juergen Goertz in his

---

guerres de religion (Paris, 1998), pp. 124-5; «L'assemblee de la noblesse et commun estat du pais de Dauphine, teneue à Valence le XXVII[e] jour de janvier 1563», B.M. Grenoble, MS R 7568, article 32.

23 Moeller, *Reichstadt und Reformation* (Gütersloh, 1962). This work was translated into both French and English. A revised second edition appeared in 1987.

24 Brady, *Ruling Class, Regime and Reformation at Strasbourg, 1520-1555* (Leiden, 1978); Steven E. Ozment. *The Reformation in the Cities: The Appeal of Protestantism to Sixteenth-Century Germany and Switzerland* (New Haven, 1975), chs. 2, 3.

25 Bernd Moeller, «Was wurde in der Frühzeit der Reformation in den deutschen Städten gepredigt?», *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* 75 (1984), 176-93; idem and Karl Stackmann, *Städtische Predigt in der Frühzeit der Reformation. Eine Untersuchung deutscher Flugschriften der Jahre 1522 bis 1529* (Göttingen, 1996).

26 Susan Karant-Nunn, «What Was Preached in the German Cities in the Early Years of the Reformation? *Wildwuchs* Versus Lutheran Unity» in Philip N. Bebb and Sherrin Marshall eds., *The Process of Change in Early Modern Europe* (Athens, Ohio, 1988), pp. 81-96; Scribner, *For the Sake of Simple Folk*, passim; Paul A. Russell, *Lay Theology in the Reformation. Popular Pamphleteers in Southwest Germany, 1521-1525* (Cambridge, 1986); Mark U. Edwards, *Printing, Propaganda and Martin Luther* (Berkeley, 1994); Miriam Usher Chrisman, *Conflicting Visions of Reform: German Lay Propaganda Pamphlets 1519-1530* (Atlantic Highlands NJ, 1996).

stimulating 1987 *Pfaffenhass und Gross Geschrei. Die reformatischen Bewegungen in Deutschland 1517-1529*. Drawing upon the ambitious Tübingen project launched in 1973 to collect and publish the entire corpus of *Flugschriften* of the early Reformation, he identified a range of themes within the pamphlets of the years 1517-1525 but judged one to recur far more insistently than any other: anti-clericalism[27]. This Reformation-era anti-clericalism was more than just the continuation of late medieval resentment of the wealth, privileges and immorality of the first estate. The Reformation principle of *sola scriptura* added the explosive charge that the practices and privileges that yielded so much of the wealth of the church lacked biblical foundation, casting the clergy not simply as greedy and debauched, but also as frauds and swindlers. No student of the French Reformation has as yet accorded this new, high-octane anti-clericalism as central a place in the struggles of the era as Goertz does for the German case, but his thesis could obviously be extended to France as well. It receives some support from the studies of Jeltine Ledegang-Keegstra and Marie-Madeleine Fragonard in a recent *cahier* of Clermont-Ferrand's Centre d'Histoire «Espaces et Cultures» devoted to humanist and Protestant anti-clericalism[28].

Strikingly, not a single one of the titles mentioned in the preceding five paragraphs is cited by Gilmont, Griffin or the contributors to Gilmont and Kemp. They scarcely appear in the footnotes in Zinguer and Yardeni. Pettegree is certainly well aware of them, for he summarized the debate among historian of the German Reformation about where to locate the core of the evangelical movement's appeal in his 1992 edited volume *The Early Reformation in Europe*[29]. But as we have seen, even his *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* does not really engage with this debate. Surely, however, if we want to understand what persuaded people to embrace the Protestant cause and act on its behalf, we need to know what messages were articulated particularly strongly within the books, sermons, and discussions that accompanied its most explosive periods of growth. To return to the case of France, amid the years of Protestantism's ebullient growth between 1555 and 1562, was the cause presented first and foremost as a war against the idols? A way to overcome poverty? A *désangoissement*

---

27 Hans-Juergen Goertz, *Pfaffenhass und Gross Geschrei. Die reformatorischen Bewegungen in Deutschland 1517-1529* (Munich, 1987), esp. p. 118 «Das grosse, stets wiederkehrende und fast überall angeschlagene Thema in den reformatorischen Flugschriften aber ist der Antiklerikalismus.» The Tübingen Sonderforschungsbereich Spätmittelalter und Reformation project on *Flugschriften* was financed from 1973 to 1984. Its fruits include Hans-Joachim Köhler, *Bibliographie der Flugschriften des 16. Jahrhunderts. Teil I Das frühe 16. Jahrhundert (1501-1530)* (3 vols. to date covering the letters A-S, Tübingen, 1991-6), the IDS microfilm publication of hundreds of the pamphlets; and Alejandro Zorzin, *Karlstadt als Flugschriftenauthor* (Göttingen, 1990).

28 J. L. R. Ledegang-Keelstra, «Le Passavant de Théodore de Bèze, thèmes et termes anticléricaux» and Marie-Madeleine Fragonard, «Anticléricalisme et plaisanteries douteuses sur le clergé en milieu protestant» in *L'humaniste, le protestant et le clerc. De l'anticléricalisme croyant au XVI^e siècle. Siècles: Cahiers du Centre d'Histoire «Espaces et Cultures»* 18 (2004), 59-91.

29 Pettegree, «The Early Reformation in Europe: A German Affair or an International Movement?» in Pettegree ed., *The Early Reformation in Europe* (Cambridge, 1992), pp. 15-18.

built on confidence in predestination and justification by faith? A war against «*Jean Le Blanc*» (the consecrated host)? «*La guerre aux rasés*», fueled by the new high-octane anti-clericalism? Or better yet, since these themes were clearly not mutually exclusive, what was the relative place of each one of these themes within the propaganda that sought to rally people to the cause? To which of these themes do French men and women seem particularly to have responded? The literature on printing, propaganda and persuasion ought to engage more directly with these questions.

As we have already seen, Griffin's book offers important evidence of relevance here. The extant literature and most easily available sources provide some more. In the interest of stimulating further study of these questions, it seems worthwhile to draw these together to see what preliminary conclusions they suggest. Of course, definitive answers must await more systematic research.

The first step in sifting the scores of evangelical books and pamphlets that circulated in France around 1560 requires identifying those that had an exceptional dissemination or echo. Geneviève Guilleminot's unpublished but extremely instructive 1977 *thèse de l'Ecole des Chartes* surveying the output of French presses in 1561 offers a good starting point. Among the 87 works of a more or less clearly Protestant character that she identifies from this peak year for francophone Protestant printing, four stand out as having been particularly enthusiastically snatched up by purchasers, since each was published five to seven times before the year was out. These were Theodore Beza's harangue before the Colloquy of Poissy; the *Ample discours des Actes de Poissy*, an account of the same event that summarizes the speeches made by Beza, Michel de l'Hôpital, and the Cardinal of Lorraine; the *Harangue et Remonstrance du Peuple et Tiers Estat* delivered by Claude de Bretagne at the Estates-General of Pontoise; and Augustin Marlorat's *Remonstrance à la Royne Mere du Roy par ceux qui sont persecutez pour la parole de Dieu. En laquelle ils rendent raison des principaux articles de la Religion, et qui sont aujourdhuy en dispute*[30].

It is notorious that the debates at Poissy turned above all on the question of the eucharist. Beza's oration also treated the questions of justification by faith and the bondage of the will. Claude de Bretagne's speech at Pontoise urged that the Reformed be allocated churches for their gatherings, called for fraternal discussions to restore religious concord and reform the church, and advocated a transformation of the First Estate that would redirect two thirds of the revenue of ecclesiastical benefices to the care of the poor. Here we see the appearance of the theme of the «conquest of poverty» within one of the most widely reprinted works of 1561. Marlorat's *Remontrance à la Royne Mere* opens by protesting that the Huguenots were loyal to the crown and rebutting the most slanderous accusations made against them in Catholic propaganda. It denounces false prophets who invent tales of weeping crucifixes, souls returning from purgatory, and the power of holy water to drive out demons. As kings are «vicaires et ministres de Dieu à revancher son honneur contre ceux qui le veulent usurper», the crown should put an end to such abuses, suspend the persecution of Protestantism, and hear out the spokesmen of both religious camps. The proper

[30] Guilleminot, «Religion et politique à la veille des guerres civiles», I, 96, 109.

worship of God requires a vernacular liturgy, the abolition of the mass, communion in both kinds, the singing of psalms, and an end to the adoration of images. Above all «la marchandise qu'on fait de tirer les ames de purgatoire» and in selling benefices and even the sacraments must be ended. The longest portion of the remonstrance is an exercise in controversy centered around the questions of the eucharist, the cult of the saints, and the veneration of images. True devotion is spiritual and must be addressed exclusively to God. Instead of making offerings to statues, Christians should give to those on earth whom God created in his image, the poor. In these most frequently reprinted Protestant works of 1561, we encounter all five of the themes highlighted in the different interpretations of where the core of the Protestant message was to be found.

A second sampling of printed works that obtained broad dissemination around the same time is provided by the titles peddled at the fair of Guibray in 1560 that are listed in the vivid account of that mid-summer trade fair sent to Geneva by an anonymous minister[31]. His letter names six books hawked through the fair grounds:

1. *Articles veritables sur les horribles grans et importables abus de la messe papale.* This is a republication of the 1534 placards. Several passages added to the original intensify the polemic against the absurd idea that a thirty-year-old man should be hidden in a little wafer of dough and against «le Pape et toute sa vermine de Cardinaux, d'Evesques, de prestres, de moines, et autres caphards diseurs de messes» who, by maintaining such a fiction, show themselves to be «faux-prophetes, damnables trompeurs, apostats, loups, faux-pasteurs, idolatres, seducteurs, menteurs et blasphemateurs execrables, meurtriers des ames, renonceurs de Jesus Christ, de sa mort et passion, faux-témoins, traistres larrons et ravisseurs de l'honneur de Dieu, et plus détestables que les diables»[32].

2. *Juste complainte des fideles de France contre les papistes et autres infideles.* Written in March or April 1560 after the Conspiracy of Amboise, this pamphlet is chiefly an attack on the Guises and a lament for those who died in the repression of the failed enterprise. It contains the ringing declaration, «Un Magistrat, soit Roy, Empereur, etc. qui fait quelque Edit inique, desja n'est-il

---

31 This undated letter is published in *Calvini Opera* eds. G. Baum, E. Cunitz and E. Reuss (Braunschweig, 1863-1900), XVIII, 662-70; «Une Mission à la Foire de Guibray», *Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français* 28 (1879), 455-64; and in translation in Alastair Duke, Gillian Lewis and Andrew Pettegree eds., *Calvinism in Europe 1540-1610: A Collection of Documents* (Manchester, 1992), pp. 81-88. The editors of the *Opera Calvini* assigned the date 1561 to it. Subsequent editors followed this dating, as did I in my *Rouen during the Wars of Religion* (Cambridge, 1981), p. 56. However, a pamphlet rebuttal of one of the tracts sold at the fair, René des Freuz, *Briefve response aux quatre execrables Articles contre la saincte Messe... publiez à la foyre de Guybray, 1560* (n.p., 1561) indicates that the letter should be dated to 1560, as has been noted by both Gabrielle Berthoud, *Antoine Marcourt Réformateur et Pamphlétaire du 'Livre des Marchans' aux Placards de 1534* (Geneva, 1973), p. 161, and Guilleminot, «Religion et politique», II, 72-4.

32 Robert Hari, «Les placards de 1534» in *Aspects de la propagande religieuse,* pp. 79-142, esp. pp. 115, 116.

plus Magistrat en cela, et si lui desobeir n'est pas desobeir à un Roy, ains à un tyran.»[33]

3. *Epitre envoyée au tigre de France.* This is Hotman's famous denunciation of the Guises, also dating from the months that followed the Conspiracy of Amboise[34].

4. *Les commandements de Dieu et ceux du pape antechrist romain.* I have not been able to identify this work with certitude, but it is probably the last pair of images from the *Antithese des faits de Jesus Christ and du Pape*, where «Les commandements de Dieu» and «Les commandements du Pape» are displayed on facing pages.

5. *Le traité des reliques des prestres.* This is probably Calvin's satirical attack on the cult of relics, *Avertissement très utile du grand profit qui reviendrait à la chrétienté s'il se faisait inventaire de tous les corps saints et reliques qui sont tant en Italie qu'en France, Allemagne, Espagne et autres royaumes et pays*, which went through eleven editions between 1543 and 1561, six of them in French[35].

6. *La doctrine nouvelle et ancienne.* This is Urbanus Rhegius' widely translated 1526 *Novae Doctrinae ad veterem collatio*, of which French editions are known from 1542, 1544, 1551, and 1561 (two editions)[36]. The work states points of Catholic doctrine and then systematically rebuts them. The attack centers primarily on works righteousness and the associated Roman practices that the Protestants condemned as unscriptural. The mass as sacrifice, the reservation of communion wine for the clergy, the cult of the consecrated host, the superiority of bishops to ordinary priests, the authority of the Pope and church councils, and the irrevocability of vows are also challenged[37].

In conclusion, in addition to topical pamphlets vilifying the house of Lorraine, the treatises sold at this fair attacked *Jean Le Blanc*, the cult of the saints, clerical fraud, and Catholic teachings on works righteousness.

The anonymous minister who preached at Guibray also told Calvin about his own sermons and included some precious details about how the Protestant titles

---

[33] Monique Droin-Bridel, «Vingt-sept pamphlets huguenots 1560-1562» in *Polémiques religieuses. Etudes et textes* (Geneva, 1979), pp. 236-42, esp. p. 238.

[34] Charles Read ed., *Le Tigre de 1560* (Paris, 1560) is a modernized edition with introduction. See also Donald R. Kelley, *François Hotman: A Revolutionary's Ordeal* (Princeton, 1973), pp. 112-20; Daniel Ménager, «Le *Tigre* et la mission du pamphlétaire» in *Le pamphlet en France au XVI^e siècle*, pp. 23-34.

[35] Rodolphe Peter and Jean-François Gilmont, *Bibliotheca Calviniana* Vols. 1 and 2 (Geneva, 1991-4), passim.

[36] Higman, *Piety and the People*, pp. 361-2; idem, «Ideas for Export: Translations in the Early Reformation» in *Lire et découvrir*, pp. 534-5; Jean-François Gilmont, *Bibliographie des éditions de Jean Crespin 1550-1572* (Verviers, 1981), I, 135.

[37] I consulted the 1544 edition, *La doctrine nouvelle et ancienne. Lesquelles arguent ensemble, pour donner à congnoistre par la Verité Evangelique les abuz qui sont advenuz au monde. Nouvellement reveue et augmentee, selon la verité de la saincte Escripture, et des droictz canons* [Geneva: Jean Michel].

were sold and received. His sermons stressed the importance of grace in salvation, insisted upon the conformity of Protestant teaching to that of the church fathers, spelled out the Reformed view of the eucharist, and exhorted those present to reform their conduct and to shun all vices, especially idolatry and blasphemy. He also urged his listeners to read the Scriptures and engage in family devotions until public preaching of the true faith was allowed. A clear difference of orientation can be observed between these themes and the cries of the peddlers hawking Protestant pamphlets through the fairground, who focused on the eucharist and the clergy. «L'abolition de la messe! La ruine de la puante messe!» they shouted. «Voila la ruine des joueurs de la belle farse qui se déguisent pour tromper le monde! Voila comme les marchans qui vendoyent la fine marchandise s'en vont abolis!». When some clergymen present dared to protest, they were silenced by onlookers who told them «Fins marchans, apprenez à travailler; vous avez trop mangé sans rien faire!» Some were rudely shoved into the mud. Groups of supporters of the new faith also took it upon themselves to dismantle the stalls used by the prostitutes who worked the fair. It is tempting to see this displacement of concerns toward the eucharistic question and attacks on the clergy as being more broadly typical of the transmission of the Reformed message from sermons and print to the cries of the street and crowd action. Such a displacement is also suggested by Griffin's discovery that the French journeymen who fell afoul of the Spanish Inquisition more often expressed scorn for Catholic practices they now found idolatrous or fraudulent than a confident understanding of the positive points of Reformed doctrine.

A similar shift may also be observed when Protestant propaganda moved from word to image. As has already been indicated, very little graphic propaganda was produced during the growth period of the French Reformation. Just eight prints or sets of prints survive that seem clearly to have been produced for circulation within France between 1530 and 1575. Precisely because this corpus is so small, it is an easy matter to survey it. Of course, Pettegree might argue that these images were not an important instrument of conversion to the Protestant cause. In any event, they sought to express important elements of the cause's message in a compact, widely accessible format. At least a few of them attained wide dissemination.

Two images or sets of images circulated especially widely. First were the paired woodcuts of the *Antithèse des faicts de Jesus Christ et du Pape*, which we have already met. After an original publication by Pierre de Vingle in Neuchâtel in 1533 or 1534 under the title *Les faictz de Jesus Christ et du Pape*, this reworking and expansion of Lucas Cranach's *Passional Christi und Antichristi* was republished in Geneva in 1557 with new wood blocks by Pierre Eskrich and substantial additional verse text by Simon Du Rosier. Three Latin editions of 1557 and 1558 were soon followed by at least three French editions of 1560 and 1561. Four more editions appeared over the next four decades. Individual images or pairs of images from the series were also used to illustrate works as varied as Ochino's *Antichrist* and Sleidan's *Commentaries on Religion and the State in the Reign of the Emperor Charles V*[38]. This work is above all else an attack on the

[38] Scribner, *For the Sake of Simple Folk*, pp. 150-8; Paul Chaix, «Un pamphlet genevois du XVI[e] siècle: l'Antithèse de S. Du Rosier: Recherche iconographique» in *Mélanges*

Pope and the Catholic clergy. The great majority of the images contrast the Pontiff's pomp, pride, avarice, and militarism with Christ's simplicity, humility, charity, and love of peace. One pair juxtaposes Christ's last supper with the «fausse ordonnance qu'est de la Messe en la Papalité»; they are as far removed from one another as day and night.

The second widely disseminated image was the woodcut of *The Papal Marmite Overturned*, which is known to have been sold publicly in Laon in early 1562 and circulated sufficiently to provoke a printed rebuttal[39]. It packs a number of themes into a single image: the corruption and avarice of the Roman clergy; the imminent overthrow of the Pope now that the spread of the Gospel has removed the blindfolds from the eyes of the laity; and the exemplary force of martyrdom.

Of the other six known French satirical or polemical images from the period c. 1530-c. 1570, one, the *Allegory of the Old and New Testaments*, seeks to convey Luther's stark contrast between Law and Gospel and the doctrine of justification by faith[40]. One, *Guillot le songeur*, is an allegory of the abusive power of the house of Guise[41]. The others all direct their fire against the Papal church, variously depicting it as a boutique of false wares, a continent of abuses, and a tree blossoming with corrupt nuns and clergymen of numerous species[42]. Within the surviving visual propaganda for the French Reformation, thus, the new, high-octane anticlericalism unquestionably dominates.

It would thus seem initially that the widely disseminated pamphlets of the period of Protestantism's most rapid growth within France devoted substantial attention to all of the themes highlighted by recent historians. The attack on the mass and on the Pope and his false practices probably occupied somewhat more space than the others; the appeal to redistribute church wealth to more useful

---

offerts à M. Paul-E. Martin (Geneva, 1961), pp. 467-82; Philip Benedict, «Of Marmites and Martyrs: Images and Polemics in the Wars of Religion» in *The French Renaissance in Prints from the Bibliothèque Nationale de France* (Los Angeles, 1994), pp. 117-18, 134; Reinhard Bodenmann and William Kemp, «*Les Faictz de Jesus Christ et du Pape* (fin 1533). Aux origines germaniques d'un traité illustré de langue française» in *La Réforme dans l'espace germanique au XVI^e siècle: images, représentations, diffusion* (Montbéliard, 2005), pp. 181-208. Reinhard Bodenmann is currently preparing a critical edition of *Les faictz de Jesus Christ et du Pape*.

39 Benedict, «Marmites and Martyrs», pp. 108-10; Frank Lestringant, «Le Cannibale et la Marmite», *Bulletin du Bibliophile*, (1996) 83-100.

40 *French Renaissance in Prints*, catalogue entry 5.

41 André Blum, *L'estampe satirique en France pendant les guerres de religion: les origines de la caricature politique* (Paris, 1916), pp. 241-2; Benedict, «Marmites and Martyrs», pp. 118-20; *Correspondance de Théodore de Bèze* ed. H. Meylan, A. Dufour et al. (Geneva, 1960-), III, 78-9.

42 The works in question are *Le veau-moine et l'ane-pape*, *Le Mappe-monde nouvelle papistique*, *Celuy qui en Satan se fie james nen a que tronperie*, and the frontispiece to Antoine Du Pinet's *Taxe des parties casuelles de la boutique du Pape*. On these see Benedict, «Marmites and Martyrs», pp. 118-20; Frank Lestringant, «L'*Histoire de la Mappe-Monde Papistique*», *Comptes rendus de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* (1998), 699-730, with references to the prior literature on this work; and Benedict, *History through Images in the Sixteenth Century: The* Wars, Massacres and Troubles *of Tortorel and Perrissin* (forthcoming, Geneva, 2007), p. x.

social purposes probably occupied the least. Above all, what stands out is the range of chords sounded in the most widely circulating tracts. By contrast, the limited corpus of visual propaganda for the cause focused far more thoroughly on depicting the Pope and his clergy as swindlers preying on the faithful. The evidence of lay reception of Reformation propaganda suggests that even among literate artisans the negative reaction against practices now regarded as fraudulent or idolatrous was more often and more confidently expressed than the positive confession of doctrines such as predestination or justification by faith alone. Reformed ministers announced the faith's central teachings on justification, the eucharist, and the obligation to respect the established authorities, but hawkers who spread Protestant pamphlets were far more prone to decry the mass and the Pope, and converts quickly responded with attacks on statuary, the clergy, and moral corruption. The consoling message of justification by faith alone: the withering critique of such core late medieval Christian practices as the worship of the Holy Sacrament and the cult of the saints on the grounds that these were unscriptural; the anger that this inspired against a clergy already seen as corrupt but now seen as lying as well; and the hope of social transformation through the absorption of the proper spirit of the Gospel and the better use of resources previously squandered on church practices all persuaded people to cast their lot with the Protestant cause; but it seems that the attack on idolatry, the mass, and the clergy particularly galvanized them to move quickly from a general conviction of the rightness of the cause to direct action against the old ecclesiastical order – to move in Pettegree's terms from understanding to activism.

More research is clearly needed before this initial impression can be taken to offer anything other than the roughest approximation of an answer to the question, «What was it in the evangelical teaching that excited, moved or persuaded French men and women to embrace the Protestant cause?» More attention must also be paid to the rhetoric of the most persuasive works of propaganda, as well as to their arguments. By 1555 many people in France had already had some exposure to evangelical ideas. What techniques of persuasion convinced those already sympathetic to the cause that a clean break was required with the established church and that making such a break would not endanger the proper order of society but might even enhance it?

If the answers to such questions are not yet fully clear, the way forward undoubtedly is, thanks largely to the work of the authors reviewed here. The short title catalogue of the French Vernacular Book Project will soon provide the basis for carrying out surveys of the dominant themes and rhetorical strategies of printed propaganda of the period 1555-1562 as comprehensive and authoritative as the work already done on the years prior to 1550 by Higman, Gilmont, and Denommé. As both *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* and Gilmont's essay in *Les deux réformes chrétiennes* suggest, more work needs to be done on contents of songs and sermons to get away from the excessive focus on printed books as vectors of the French Reformation. It can be hoped that more historians as resourceful and perceptive as Griffin will turn up further evidence about just how individuals from different strata of society received, understood, internalized, and sought to live by those strands of the Protestant message that reached their eyes or ears. Systematic quantitative surveys of the full range of Protestant

crowd actions in the manner of Charles Tilly and Jean Nicolas are also needed to tell us more about what teachings particularly sparked outrage or zeal[43].

The work of the past fifty years has thus not only filled out our knowledge of the printers and books who spread the French Reformation. It has shown us how the rich tradition of the history of the book might be brought into closer dialogue with some important discussions about just what the French and European Reformations were all about for those caught up in them. The next step is to engage this dialogue more fully.

Geneva. Philip BENEDICT

[43] Charles Tilly, *The Contentious French : Four Centuries of Popular Struggle* (Cambridge, Mass., 1986) ; Jean Nicolas, *La rébellion française. Mouvements populaires et conscience sociale 1661-1789* (Paris, 2002).